



Agenda Item #: _____

Staff Report

City of Manhattan Beach

TO: Honorable Mayor Powell and Members of the City Council

THROUGH: David N. Carmany, City Manager

FROM: Jim Arndt, Public Works Director
Bruce Moe, Finance Director
Gwen Eng, General Services Manager
Juan Price, Maintenance Superintendent
Keith Darling, Facilities Supervisor

DATE: June 5, 2012

SUBJECT: Grant Funded Purchase of Energy Efficient Walk Street Replacement Lights from Walters Wholesale Electric in the Amount of \$39,737.25 and Appropriation of \$137,212.34 from Unreserved General Fund Monies for Completion of the Walk Street Project and Additional Energy Efficient Grant Funded Lighting Replacement Projects

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the City Council: a) award bid #844-12 to Walters Wholesale Electric, the lowest responsible bidder, in the amount of \$39,737.25 for energy efficient replacement lights for the Walk Streets; and b) appropriate \$137,212.34 from the unreserved General Fund balance for this project as well as other planned energy efficient lighting projects which will be fully reimbursed at a later date by funding from the Department of Energy.

FISCAL IMPLICATION:

In September 2009, the City was awarded a federal stimulus grant under the Energy Efficiency and Community Block Grant (EECBG) program from the Department of Energy in the amount of \$186,000, consisting of \$155,800 of reimbursable costs and approximately \$30,000 of City project management in-kind match. The purpose of the grant is to replace inefficient lighting with better technology products that reduce greenhouse gas emissions. The first major project, retrofitting of Strand lighting, was completed in the amount of \$18,587.66 using FY 2010-2011 appropriated funds. The Walk Street project and additional lighting replacement projects are not budgeted items in FY 2011-2012 and an appropriation of \$137,212.34 is required from the General Fund for the balance of the grant. The project will be completed by September 2012, and fully reimbursed by the Department of Energy.

BACKGROUND:

The Walk Street lights have reached end of life due to internal corrosion problems and lack of available replacement parts. The existing Walk Street lights vary by street and replacement fixtures are not available on 16th Street, 17th Street, 18th Street, and 20th Street. The existing fixtures are internally corroded and difficult and costly to rebuild. Because replacement fixtures are not available, there are already mismatched internal parts in a few instances including high and low pressure sodium.

In order to more efficiently manage maintenance, staff is standardizing on one LED (light emitting diode) fixture for the Walk Streets, specifically chosen to withstand the coastal environment and allow maximum flexibility in brightness and perceived “warmth”. Standardizing on fixture types will ensure there are repair parts into the foreseeable future and reduced inventory as well.

Staff did receive feedback from one resident upon completion of the Strand lighting retrofit regarding brightness. Therefore, the light levels of the originally installed high pressure sodium lamps were measured and were shown to be identical to the newly installed induction lamps. (No other complaints were made regarding the lumen levels.)

DISCUSSION:

At its December 6, 2011 meeting, City Council requested that staff conduct a survey of residents to determine which lighting option was preferred. Consequently, three light fixtures styles (Jamestown, Barcelona, and Acorn) were purchased and installed for public comment. Please see Attachment A (Notice soliciting resident comment), to view images of the three fixture styles. A summary of the resident responses is below:

- 36 responses by email or phone
- 24 votes for the Jamestown as their first choice and 3 as their second choice
- 11 votes for the Barcelona as their first choice and 1 as their second choice
- 1 vote for none, (requesting the Strand lights as a choice)
- Nearly unanimous that the Acorn is not acceptable

Based on this survey, the Jamestown light fixture is the preferred fixture. This new fixture will be an energy efficient lantern style LED “dark-sky” compliant light able to withstand the coastal environmental. Benefits include an ability to cast light downwards rather than in an omnidirectional pattern, and a “warm white” output. Please refer to Attachment B for a detailed schematic of the Jamestown fixture.

Bid Recaps

Staff requested bids and a total of ten responses were received including multiple bids from three vendors. The comparison below shows the aggregate price, including sales tax and shipping:

<u>Vendor</u>	<u>Total Bid (Incl. Tax)</u>
1. Starled, Inc.	\$26,426.25
2. Walters Wholesale Electric	\$39,737.25
3. Walters Wholesale Electric	\$43,717.50

4. West-Lite Supply Co., Inc.	\$43,810.81
5. West-Lite Supply Co., Inc.	\$44,576.19
6. Walters Wholesale Electric	\$44,989.88
7. Inglewood Wholesale Electric	\$47,045.25
8. ISBS Group	\$49,860.64
9. Nularis LED	\$54,080.88
10. Inglewood Wholesale Electric	\$58,421.59

The lowest bidder, Starled, Inc., could not provide verification that their product is dark-sky compliant and provided a shorter warranty period than specified. As a result, Starled was bypassed as being non-responsive.

The next lowest bidder, Walters Wholesale Electric, offered a product which does meet specifications. Walters Wholesale Electric offered multiple bids on several products. As a result, staff recommends awarding the bid to Walters Wholesale Electric as the lowest responsible bidder for the purchase of LED lantern lights in the amount of \$39,737.25. These lights will be installed by City staff and the project will be completed within 3-4 months.

Based on staff's field measurements, the current annual electricity consumption is 10,687 kilowatt hours (kWh). With the new lights, the estimated consumption is approximately 2,900 kWh, which equates to a 73 percent energy savings. Staff expects the annual energy costs to drop from \$1,500 to approximately \$400 per year.

MUNICIPAL PARKING LOT LIGHTING:

After the completion of the Walk Street project, energy efficient replacement lighting in several municipal parking lots is planned utilizing using the same Department of Energy grant funds until the grant is fully expended. These projects will be accomplished through a competitive bid process and any project that exceeds the City's formal bid limit of \$20,000 will be submitted to City Council for recommendation of award.

CONCLUSION:

Staff is requesting that City Council a) award bid #844-12 to Walters Wholesale Electric in the amount of \$39,737.25 for energy efficient replacement lights for the Walk Streets; and b) appropriate \$137,212.34 for FY 2011-2012 and FY 2012-2013 from the unreserved General Fund balance for this project as well as other planned energy efficient lighting projects which will be fully reimbursed at a later date by funding from the Department of Energy.

Attachments:

- A. Notice soliciting resident comment
- B. Jamestown fixture diagram

cc: Sona Kalapura, Environmental Programs Manager

Attachment A: Notice soliciting resident comment



Dear Resident,

The City maintains an on-going program to repair, replace and improve lighting throughout City streets, parks, and facilities. The walk street lighting in your area has been selected for upgrades to LED lighting due to wear, electrical efficiency, and lack of repair parts.

We have selected 3 fixture styles that meet dark sky, electrical, and corrosion standards and are soliciting resident comment. Once we receive resident input, a cool white or warm white lamp and fixture style (Jamestown, Acorn, Barcelona) will be selected and we will replace all walk street lights uniformly. Our calculations indicate that regardless of style, electrical consumption will be approximately 50% of existing fixtures.

The Jamestown and Acorn fixtures have cool white lamps. The Barcelona lamp color is warm white. We can order any lamp color for any fixture style. The Jamestown is the easiest to shield should there be objectionable light spilling into resident's windows, and is closest in design to most of the existing fixtures.

Jamestown



Acorn



Barcelona



Samples installed on 19th St. between Ocean and Highland

Comments will be accepted through May 30st, 2012. Please forward your comments to:

Keith Darling, Facilities Supervisor
3621 Bell Ave
Manhattan Beach, CA 90266
310-802-5316
kdarling@citymb.info

Attachment B: Jamestown fixture diagram

Jamestown LED (JT-LED)



Opened Side View

