



Agenda Item #:



Staff Report

City of Manhattan Beach

TO: Honorable Mayor Aldinger and Members of the City Council

THROUGH: Geoff Dolan, City Manager *GD*

FROM: Richard Gill, Parks and Recreation Director
Eve Kelso, Recreation Services Manager

DATE: March 18, 2008

SUBJECT: Analysis and Review of the Dial-A-Ride Program and Alternate Forms of Transportation for Older Adults

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the City Council discuss the City's Dial-A-Ride transportation program and alternate forms of transportation for Older Adults and provide direction.

FISCAL IMPLICATION:

There is no fiscal implication to this report. The Dial-A-Ride transportation program is supported 100% through Proposition A, L.A. County transit tax. Refer to attachment A for a Financial Analysis of the Proposition A budget.

BACKGROUND:

As part of the City of Manhattan Beach City Council work plan 2007-2008, City Council requested an analysis and review of the Dial-A-Ride program and alternate forms of transportation for Older Adults.

The City of Manhattan Beach Dial-A-Ride program has been in existence since 1976. Dial-A-Ride service is available to all Manhattan Beach residents who are 55 years of age or older, or have a disability. People with temporary disabilities may also qualify. The Dial-A-Ride program is funded entirely by Proposition A transportation funds (L.A. County half-cent transit sales tax) and bus fares.

Dial-A-Ride is a Paratransit transportation service that is curb-to-curb, and often door-to-door. Transportation service is available anywhere in Manhattan Beach seven days a week from 9 am to 4 pm; and to medical facilities, Monday through Friday, in Hermosa Beach, Redondo Beach and Torrance. The Fare is 25 cents each way inside Manhattan Beach and 50 cents each way outside the city.

In addition to paratransit programs, like Dial-A-Ride, there are alternatives for Senior transportation that other cities utilize. These include cab transportation, volunteer transportation,

a combination of a Paratransit Program and cab transportation, and, regionally, ACCESS services is available for individuals with ADA qualified disabilities.

DISCUSSION:

Comparison of Transportation Options for Older Adults

1. Paratransit Program

Among the area cities who provide a paratransit program, there are some similarities and differences in the service delivery. Some cities provide the service in-house and others contract out. The basic premise of the service is that riders call to book their rides within the service hours and service area set by each city. All cities provide either curb to curb or door to door service within their own city, some cities extend their boundaries to include neighboring cities, and most programs offer trips to satellite locations, primarily medical facilities. In most cities, riders can call several days in advance to book their ride. Same day rides are less likely to be accommodated. The cost is typically very low, from free to \$1 a ride. *(See Attachment A for a comparison of area cities and the transportation that they provide.)*

2. Cab service

Some area cities contract with cab companies to offer cab service to their older adult or disabled residents by selling coupons at discounted rates to residents. There are similarities and differences in each city's delivery of this service. In some cities, there are set service areas where cab coupons are valid. In other cities, coupons may be used for a certain number of miles or to a certain boundary and then riders pay out of pocket for the remaining distance. All cities have limits on the quantity of coupons available to each rider. Customers call the cab dispatcher directly to set up their rides. The cost is typically \$1-\$8 a trip for the passenger. *(See Attachment A for a comparison of area cities and the transportation that they provide.)*

3. Combination of Paratransit Program and cab service

Some cities offer a combination of a Paratransit Program and cab coupons for their senior and disabled population. In addition to a city's Paratransit Program, older adults can purchase a limited amount of cab coupons for their general use. Cities that offer both programs are generally more restrictive and conservative with each component due primarily to costs, as opposed to cities that offer only cab service or a Paratransit program. The cost for paratransit is typically very low, from free to \$1 a ride and the cost for a cab is typically \$1 to \$8 a trip for the passenger. There are limits on the quantity of cab coupons even more so for this program. *(See Attachment A for a comparison of area cities and the transportation that they provide.)*

4. Volunteer Driver transportation program

Some counties do not receive the same funding as LA County for use towards transportation programs, so they have set up volunteer driver programs to help meet the needs of older adults. Staff visited two programs in San Diego County to learn about Volunteer Driver transportation programs. Volunteers use their own vehicles to provide rides to older adults to and from medical appointments or for errands. Additionally, several non-profit organizations

use volunteer driver programs to assist older adults. Some of the cities/ organizations who use this type of program are listed below:

- Encinitas and numerous other cities in San Diego County
- Beverly Foundation, Shepherd Center and other non-profit organizations
- Beach Cities Health District

5. ACCESS Paratransit Service

In addition to services offered by individual cities, people who meet ADA eligibility criteria and are transportationally disabled, qualify for ACCESS services administered by Los Angeles County. ACCESS Services is an Americans with Disabilities Act mandated public transportation service for people unable to independently use the bus or light rail services in Los Angeles County. This is curb to curb transportation service for people of all ages with qualifying disabilities only. Riders call in to schedule their rides the day before their trip request. Most older adults are not eligible for ACCESS Services. Customer fares range from \$1.80 to \$2.70 for a one-way trip.

Below are the pros and cons of the aforementioned forms of transportation.

Paratransit Program:

Pros

- Customers get to personally know all drivers
- With internal staff or contractors dedicated to your city, it is easier to immediately address complaints and compliments
- Drivers and Dispatchers are trained extensively to work with older adults and people with disabilities
- Customers feel comfortable asking for help
- Drivers assist customers to board the bus
- Drivers help with walkers, canes and wheelchairs
- Drivers provide general assistance for older adults

Cons

- Because it is a first come, first serve program, same day ride requests cannot always be accommodated. When same day ride requests are accommodated, customers may not receive their first choice of travel time
- The service hours are limited
- The wait time after medical appointments, outside of the city, for some riders is inconvenient
- Customers often do not know how long their medical appointment will last, making it difficult to pre-schedule a ride home
- Customers sometimes want to travel early in the morning or late in the evening
- It is a shared ride service

Cab service

Pros

- Less expensive option than paratransit programs on a trip by trip basis
- Same day calls will be accommodated
- 24 hour service is available
- No shared rides, therefore, trip time from Point A to Point B is shorter

Cons

- More difficult to control costs and fraud over time (example: In Carson, costs jumped from \$250,000 to \$500,000 in two years; West Hollywood also indicated large cost increases over a short period of time)
- The City of Redondo Beach discontinued their cab program in their FY 2005-2006 for the following reasons:
 - Costs escalated from \$23,000 to \$80,000 in one year when Redondo Beach's contract with the City of Torrance Dial A Lift changed to cabs. The projected cost for the next year for 120 people was \$338,700. The program was discontinued prior to this second increase
 - People were selling cab coupons to other individuals for \$5.00, when they were purchased for \$1.00
 - People were found to use 40 tickets a month, even though there was a limit of 16 a month per person
- In West Hollywood, fraud exists in a number of ways including customers selling cab coupons to ineligible people, and customers selling coupons to cab drivers for cash
- To control costs, most cities provide only a limited amount of ride coupons each month. Some rides require two tickets, so potentially, customers may receive fewer than 8 round trips a month
- Some cab dispatchers are located out of the area, even out of the state, making it stressful for customers to explain their location and making it difficult to track supervisors and handle customer complaints
- Cab drivers are prohibited by company policy to physically assist customers to get in and out of vehicles and to assist customers with their walkers, canes, groceries or anything beyond the curb
- Cab drivers are independent contractors who bid on trips that come through dispatch. Short trips are not always bid on, leaving older adults without a transportation alternative, especially on weekends (*feedback from City of Carson and West Hollywood*)
- Some customers have indicated that the cab drivers take the long way to the customer's destination on purpose and that the drivers can be rude
- Some customers have difficulty communicating with drivers and dispatchers due to language barriers

Volunteer Driver Transportation Program

Pros

- Close relationship between volunteer and customer
- Volunteer may have plenty of time to spend with individuals and even accompany the customer to their medical appointment
- There is potentially no wait time for the customer after their medical appointment

Cons

- Though done successfully with Beach Cities Health District, the City of Encinitas, and several other non-profit organizations, the City of Manhattan Beach Risk Manager recommends against this plan due to several inherent risks associated including:
 - City exposure to accidents, incidents and lawsuits
 - Other challenges to implementing this program include the fact that the volunteer would probably need to increase insurance coverage and assume greater liability
- A comprehensive volunteer program such as this may require additional staff hours

City of Manhattan Beach Dial-A-Ride Service

As stated earlier, Dial-A-Ride is a Paratransit program that is curb to curb, and often door to door seven days a week from 9am-4pm. There are 812 registered customers. It is estimated that approximately 150 of these customers ride on a weekly basis and another 200 ride at least monthly. Customers register for Dial-A-Ride service by calling the dispatcher and answering a few questions for the database.

The Dial-A-Ride office is located on the corner of 15th St. and Valley Drive in the post office building. There is one operator/ dispatcher on duty at a time. To schedule a ride, customers may call the Dial-A-Ride office seven days a week between 8 am and 5 pm to make their ride request(s). Dial-A-Ride is a first come, first serve program. Rides may be scheduled up to seven days in advance. It is possible to call for a ride on the same day, but the earlier a customer calls, the more likely they are to get the times they want to travel.

There are four vehicles in the Dial-A-Ride fleet—three buses and one van that are used Monday-Friday. One bus is used on the weekends. Monday through Friday, one bus is dedicated to rides to medical facilities outside of the city and one bus is dedicated to rides in Manhattan Beach. The third bus is scheduled as needed for rides inside and outside the city. Most rides are individually requested and are provided as a demand response service. Additionally, several consolidated trips are set up for destinations outside the city. There are set days and times for trips to the Del Amo Mall, South Bay Galleria, Plaza El Segundo, the 99 Cent Store, Costco, Torrance Promenade and Océangate Shopping Center. Transportation is also coordinated with the Older Adults Program to ensure transportation for special events and to provide the transportation needed for short trips planned by the Older Adults Program during and after service hours such as Movies in Oasis, Senior Health Fair, Flu Shot Clinic, and trips to lunch, shopping, etc.

As a small city, we are fortunate to be able to offer this service in-house. There are some qualities unique to City of Manhattan Beach Dial-A-Ride program that are highlighted below:

- Drivers are paid near the top of the range for bus drivers, leading to zero turnover of full time staff and very low turnover of part time staff.
- All drivers have over 10 years of driving experience, with Class B licenses
- Drivers and Dispatchers are trained extensively. For the City of Manhattan Beach, training includes:
 - Drivers' training- Behind the wheel. (Over the past six years, drivers participated three times in a state bus competition called a "Roadeo" and have qualified in the top four each time)
 - Drivers' training- written
 - Proper wheelchair securment, maneuvering
 - Sensitivity Training
 - CPR/ First Aid
 - Americans with Disabilities Act training
 - Crisis Prevention and Intervention
 - Team Building
 - Daily Meetings to discuss special customer circumstances, needs, changes in ability
- Drivers physically assist older adults from their door to the bus, including assisting with walkers, wheelchairs, groceries and bags (most cities offer a curb to curb service only)

- Drivers will get off of the bus and look for customers at medical facilities when they are not at their scheduled pick-up location, or drivers will come back to pick up customers later, or drivers will talk with customers to ensure they have a way to get home or drivers will give customers emergency cab coupons for their ride home. Staff currently purchases \$400 a year in cab coupons for emergencies.
- Drivers and Dispatchers assist in many ways with customers who are memory impaired, or who have increasing medical needs, including regular contact with family members and making referrals to Beach Cities Health District.
- Drivers stop on the way home from the doctor to allow a customer to pick up their prescription at the pharmacy.
- Drivers take customers their personal items that they left on the bus
- The City of Manhattan Beach provides a special shopping shuttle for Manhattan Senior Villas residents twice a week
- Dial-A-Ride completes an annual, voluntary report and participates in an audit for the National Transit Database through the Metropolitan Transit Authority for additional funding and to improve accountability.
- Over time, the City of Manhattan Beach Dial-A-Ride program has created relationships with businesses and doctors' offices in the community, which has led to enhanced communication between customers, drivers and businesses.
- Buses are always clean and are maintained by the bus drivers.

Because of the enhanced customer service as stated above, our costs per trip are higher than most cities; rides often take an additional five or ten minutes per trip compared with a typical curb to curb program. *(See Attachment A for a comparison of costs to area cities).*

A recent Dial-A-Ride customer satisfaction survey was completed. 812 surveys were mailed out and 190 surveys were returned. As a result of the survey, 97% of customers indicated that drivers are always or often courteous and helpful. 94% of customers indicated that drivers are always or often on time for pick ups. And, 94% of customers indicated that dispatch staff is always or often courteous and helpful.

Areas that were also positive, but could use improvement are as follows. 81% of customers indicated that they can always or often schedule a ride when they need one, however, 19% showed more difficulty in this area. 73% indicated that the wait time after medical appointments is reasonable and 27% showed this as a more difficult area.

(For complete results of the Customer Satisfaction Survey, please refer to Attachment C).

CONCLUSION:

A comparison study was made by staff of the transportation systems available to older adults in twelve communities. Findings indicate that on a trip by trip basis, cab service is often the least expensive method of providing service. However, in the long run, as stated earlier, costs have risen dramatically in the cities that did not limit the cab service. Also, the customer service advantage of our Dial-A-Ride program far exceeds that of a cab service.

Dial-A-Ride has been able to respond to the unique size and culture of our community and takes pride in meeting the transportation needs of the City's older adult population. Over the years, it has developed into a program that strives to address the social service needs of its customers

while meeting their transportation needs and helping them maintain their independence. Staff recommends that we keep the existing Dial-A-Ride service, and supplement it with a taxi or volunteer driver program.

As stated in Attachment B, there is an excess of approximately \$38,000 per year in the Proposition A transportation fund. The current Dial-A-Ride service can be expanded by adding either a supplemental cab service or volunteer driver program to improve customer service for same day ride requests and after-hours ride requests for medical, pharmacy and social service appointments that cannot be provided by Dial-A-Ride. Also, staff recommends that service be offered for extended hours and to a few additional satellite locations, like Kaiser in Harbor City and other medical facilities in Torrance, just east of our service area. There are several options for implementing a supplemental program; staff recommends four possible options, which are discussed below.

1. Dial-A-Ride dispatcher works directly with a cab company to schedule medical, pharmacy and social service rides for customers, when Dial-A-Ride service is unavailable. City would pay 100% of the cost of rides.
2. Customer pays 100% of cab fare up front and City reimburses a percentage of the cost for same day ride requests, combined with cab coupons for return trips after medical appointments, when Dial-A-Ride service is unavailable.
3. Volunteer driver program
4. Sale of cab coupons at a reduced rate

If City Council wants to expand to cab service, staff's first recommendation is that the Dial-A-Ride dispatcher work directly with a cab company to schedule medical, pharmacy and social service rides for customers, when Dial-A-Ride service is unavailable, with the City paying 100% of the cost of rides. The City could enter into a pilot project with a cab company for one year. If customers call for a ride and Dial-A-Ride is unable to provide the ride due to a full schedule, then a cab ride would be scheduled and paid for by the Dial-A-Ride dispatcher over the internet. The City would be billed for rides on a monthly basis, and could therefore keep track of the cost on an ongoing basis. This method of providing cab service would help improve transportation service in the city, while allowing the City to control the cost of the program and control fraud.

A second way to implement a cab program would be for the customer to pay 100% of their cab fare up front and request a percentage of reimbursement (example: City to pay 2/3 of the cost) from the City, when Dial-A-Ride service is unavailable. This method is recommended in combination with the provision of cab coupons for return trips after medical appointments. For same day ride requests, customers would first call the Dial-A-Ride office to try and schedule their ride. If space is unavailable, the dispatcher will document the ride request, and inform the customer that if they use a cab for this trip, the City of Manhattan Beach will reimburse them for a percentage of the fare. The customer would then need to submit their cab ride receipt to the City of Manhattan Beach to receive their reimbursement check by mail. The problem with this model is twofold. Some older adults may not have enough money on hand to pay for a round trip cab ride in the first place. Also, requesting, saving and submitting receipts may be problematic for some older adults.

In regards to return trips after medical appointments, drivers could provide customers with cab coupons for the customer's return trip, as we currently do, if there was a question of an unreasonable wait time after their medical appointment. This method for program expansion,

along with a percentage of reimbursement for same day rides, would allow staff to better manage costs and it would limit the opportunity for fraud.

A third option for supplementing the current Dial-A-Ride program is to create a volunteer driver program. Because of concerns with liability, the recommended way of setting this up would be to contract with an outside organization, such as Beach Cities Health District to provide this service. In discussions with Beach Cities Health District, the City of Manhattan Beach could utilize the surplus Proposition A funds to help pay for staff to set up this program for the City of Manhattan Beach Older Adults. Further discussions would be needed with Beach Cities Health District to determine the exact costs of the program. Volunteers would be paired with older adults to provide rides when Dial-A-Ride service was unavailable or when someone could use the help of a volunteer to stay with them during their medical appointment. This program, especially at its inception would not guarantee a ride under all circumstances. It would, however, offer a customer and senior friendly program.

A fourth option is the sale of cab coupons at a reduced rate, however, some other cities utilizing this type of program have experienced rising costs and problems with fraud. If parameters are not put on the sale of cab coupons, there is the potential for costs to rise uncontrollably within the City of Manhattan Beach, as has been the experience of several nearby cities. A limited number of coupons could be sold at a discounted rate to residents until the budget runs out (example: customers would pay \$8 for \$24 of taxi coupons). The eligibility age could also be raised to 65 to limit the number of people eligible for this program.

Please note that City Council has also expressed an interest in the past about creating a fixed route shuttle service connecting City parks and facilities (library), shopping centers, the beach, senior housing facilities... In tonight's discussion, if City Council should discuss the need to expand the existing Dial-A-Ride program to include cab service or a volunteer program, please consider that council has previously expressed an interest in using Proposition A funds to expand transportation to include a fixed route shuttle system in the future.

List of Attachments:

- A Comparison of Paratransit and Cab Programs by City, Service Days and Hours, Ages Served, Cost to Customer, Number of Trips per Year and Cost to City per Trip and Mile
- B Financial Analysis of the Proposition A Budget (Summary of last years expenditures and revenues)
- C Dial-A-Ride Customer Satisfaction Survey Results

Attachment A

Comparison of Paratransit and Cab programs by City, service days and hours, ages served, cost to customer, number of trips per year, and cost to city per trip and mile

City	Type of Transportation Service Offered	Days and Hours	Ages Served	Cost to Customer	Number of Trips per year	Cost to city per trip (2006 audited statistics)	Cost to city per passenger mile (2006 audited statistics)
City of Manhattan Beach	Paratransit Program	7 days a week 9am-4pm	55 and over	25 cents in MB 50 cents outside of MB	9,142	\$37.71	\$10.83
City of El Segundo	Paratransit Program	M- Sa 8:50 am-3pm	60 and over	Free	City does not submit data to the National Transit Database	City does not submit data to the National Transit Database	City does not submit data to the National Transit Database
City of Redondo Beach	Paratransit Program	Su-Th 6am-9pm F,Sa 6am-10pm	62 and over	\$1.00	16,979	\$21.90	\$6.16
City of Lawndale	Paratransit Program	M-F 8am-4pm	55 and over	Free	City does not submit data to the National Transit Database	City does not submit data to the National Transit Database	City does not submit data to the National Transit Database
City of Hawthorne	Paratransit Program	M-F 8:30am-5:30pm; Sa,Su 9:30am - 5pm	60 and over	50 cents	City does not submit data to the National Transit Database	City does not submit data to the National Transit Database	City does not submit data to the National Transit Database
City of Santa Monica	Paratransit Program	M-F 8am-6pm; Sa 9am-3pm; Su 8am-1pm	60 and over	50 cents	City does not submit data to the National Transit Database	City does not submit data to the National Transit Database	City does not submit data to the National Transit Database

City	Type of Transportation Service Offered	Service Days and Hours	Ages Served	Cost to Customer	Number of Trips per year	Cost to city per trip (2006 audited statistics)	Cost to city per passenger mile (2006 audited statistics)
City of Torrance	Cab Coupons	7 days a week 24 hours a day	65 and over	\$1.00-\$5.00 a ride within \$13.00 distance	City does not submit data to the National Transit Database	City does not submit data to the National Transit Database	City does not submit data to the National Transit Database
City of Carson	Cab Coupons	7 days a week 24 hrs/ day	65 and over	\$1.00	52,664	\$10.19	\$2.13
City of Malibu	Cab Coupons	M-F 8am-4pm	55 and over	\$1.00	4,748	\$21.90	\$1.59
City of Hermosa Beach	Paratransit Program and cab coupons	Paratransit 6 am-9pm S-Th and 6 am-10pm F,S Taxi is 24 hrs/day	62 and over	Paratransit \$1.00 Taxi \$1.00	City does not submit data to the National Transit Database	City does not submit data to the National Transit Database	City does not submit data to the National Transit Database
City of West Hollywood	Paratransit Program and cab coupons	Paratransit M-F 8:30am-4:30pm Taxi 24 hrs/day	60 and over 65 and over for Taxi	Free Paratransit Taxi \$8.00 for \$24.00 in taxi coupons	21,787 60,093	\$50.93 Paratransit \$ 5.76 Taxi	\$6.93 Paratransit \$1.93 Taxi
City of Beverly Hills	Paratransit Program and cab coupons	Paratransit M-F 9am-3:30pm Taxi is 24 hours	62 and over	Free Paratransit Taxi \$6.00 for \$24.00 taxi coupons	Paratransit does not submit data to the National Transit Database	Paratransit does not submit data to the National Transit Database \$ 6.58 Taxi	Paratransit does not submit data to the National Transit Database \$2.31 Taxi

- *Costs per trip and costs per passenger mile are affected by a number of variables including driver salaries, amount of farebox revenue brought in by each city and level of customer service provided.*
- *Our current City of Manhattan Beach Dial-A-Ride audited data shows that the number of trips provided last fiscal year('06-'07) increased by over 600 trips, and in the current fiscal year, our data shows that Dial-A-Ride provided 5,749 trips in the first six months, thus projecting an additional increase of over 1,500 trips in the current fiscal year.*

Attachment B

Financial Analysis of the Proposition A Budget (Summary of last years expenditures and revenues).

Annual Expenditures

- FY 2006-2007
 - \$389,711 Dial-A-Ride
 - \$80,000 Beach Cities Transit
 - \$10,000 Ocean Express
 - \$61,727 Recreational and Senior Bus Trips
 - \$8,864 Student Bus Pass Subsidies
 - \$550,302 TOTAL Prop A Budget 2006-2007

Annual Revenues

- FY 2006-2007
 - \$589,751 from transit sales tax
 - \$9,994 from NTD (National Transit Database) reporting
 - \$3,653 from Dial-A-Ride fares
 - \$3,287 from bus pass subsidies
 - \$606,685 TOTAL Revenues Prop A Budget 2006-2007

- Surplus from FY 2006-2007 = \$56,383

- Average annual surplus (Revenues/ Expenditures) from the past five years, not including vehicle purchases, other capital purchases, Beach Cities transit funds or Prop A dollars sold for General Fund dollars= \$108,620/ year

- According the vehicle replacement plan, the projected amount needed to save annually towards new bus purchases over the next ten years, keeping in mind CNG conversions and hybrid options = \$70,250/ year

- This makes the Actual Surplus of Prop A funds approximately \$38,000 / year

Attachment C

At the end of 2007, 812 Rider Satisfaction Surveys were mailed out. 190 surveys were returned. The results are documented below.

1.) I have been a Dial-A-Ride Patron for:

	# Responses	Percentages
Less than a year	34	18%
Between 1 and 3 years	53	28%
Greater than 3 years	84	44%
No answer	19	10%
<i>total</i>	190	100%

2.) Please tell us your age:

Under 55	4	2%
Between 55 and 64 years	20	10%
Between 65 and 74 years	46	24%
Between 75 and 85 years	96	51%
Over 85 years	22	12%
No answer	2	1%
<i>total</i>	190	100%

3.) On average, I use Dial-A-Ride:

More than once a week	44	23%
More than once a month	30	16%
A few times a year	61	32%
Other	48	25%
*Limited time due to medical conditions...		
*Signed up but have not used yet		
*Almost never		
*Only once or twice		
No answer	7	4%
<i>total</i>	190	100%

4.) I use Dial-A-Ride for:

Shopping	66	35%
Socializing	15	8%
Senior Activities	31	16%
Medical Appointments	116	61%
Other	34	18%
No answer	30	16%

(church, bank, volunteer work, gym, hair dresser, MB Historic House etc.)

5.) How did you learn about the City of Manhattan Beach Dial-A-Ride Program? # Percentages

How did you learn about the City of Manhattan Beach Dial-A-Ride Program?	#	Percentages
City Newsletter	43	23%
Newspaper	15	8%
Dial-A-Ride Brochure	57	30%
Word of Mouth	44	23%
Other (please describe)	17	9%
No answer	26	14%

(seen buses, care manager, real estate agent, beach reporter, MB brochure)

6.) Drivers are on time to pick me up (within 15 minutes of scheduled pick up).

Always	98	65%
Often	43	29%
Sometimes	8	5%
Seldom	1	<1%
Never	0	0
No answer	38	
<i>total</i>	188	100%

7.) I find that the drivers are courteous and helpful:

Always	127	85%
Often	19	13%
Sometimes	4	2%
Seldom	0	0
Never	0	0
No answer	40	
<i>total</i>	190	100%

8.) I find that the dispatch staff is courteous and helpful:

Always	123	81%
Often	20	13%
Sometimes	9	6%
Seldom	0	0
Never	0	0
No answer	38	
<i>total</i>	190	100%

9.) I am able to schedule a ride when I need one:

	#	Percentages
Always	56	38%
Often	64	43%
Sometimes	19	13%
Seldom	7	5%
Never	2	1%
No answer	42	
<i>total</i>	190	100%

10.) In regards to medical trips outside of the city, I feel that the wait time for the bus after my doctor appointment is reasonable?

	#	Percentages
Always	37	33%
Often	45	40%
Sometimes	21	19%
Seldom	8	7%
Never	1	1%
No answer	68	
Never use it for medical rides	10	
<i>total</i>	190	100%

11.) Dial-A-Ride currently goes outside of the City to the following destinations on designated days: Costco, Del Amo Mall, El Camino College, Green Line Station, 99 Cent Store (Monday-Friday), Oceangate Shopping Center, Plaza El Segundo, South Bay Galleria, Torrance Promenade

Where else would you like Dial-A-Ride to go? (open-ended question)

	# Responses
No Answer	117
LAX	78
El Segundo Plaza during weekdays	3
Social Security office	3
Wal Mart (Torrance)	3
City and Cultural Entertainment events after hours	2
Hermosa Beach Shopping areas	2

	# Responses
Home Depot on Tues.	2
Movies @ Manhattan Village Mall	2
Pacific Movie Theaters in El Segundo	2
99 Cent Store (Hawthorne)	1
All of South Bay	1
Amtrak	1
Anderson Park	1
Auto Dealers (service appts)	1
Camino on Monday PM	1
Discovery Program @ El Camino (Mon. afternoons)	1
Dr. offices on Crenshaw	1
El Segundo Salons	1
Food 4 Less on Tues.	1
Friday Farmer's Market	1
Galleria during the week	1
Golf Course in El Segundo	1
Harbor Hospital	1
Kaiser in Gardena and Harbor City	1
Little Company of Mary	1
Manhattan Beach Community Church	1
Marina del Rey	1
Museums	1
Poliwog Park for Summer concerts	1
Redondo Beach Library	1
Regular destinations outside of City	1
Ross on Tues.	1
Santa Monica Medical Centers	1
St. Johns Health Center in Santa Monica	1
The Strand/Pier	1
Top of Sand Dune Park	1
Torrance YMCA	1
UCLA Harbor Hospital	1
Weekly Scheduled trips to Farmers' Market	1
Westchester	1

12.) What is the best thing about the City of Manhattan Beach Dial-A-Ride Service? (open-ended question)

	# Responses
No Answer	59
Knowing its there when you need it	33
Price	27
Friendly Staff	18
Very Convenient	14
Helpful drivers	12
Great service	11
Drivers and staff are helpful with scheduling	9
Unique service	9
Provides independence in shopping for myself	6
Safe	6
Clean	5
The Drivers	5
Dependable	4
Door to door capability	4
Helps those who don't drive get around	4
A luxury for those unable to drive	3
Carry groceries/packages	3
Good program	3
Great service even though I still drive	3
I'm familiar with the drivers	3
Meeting new people/making friends	3
Michelle	3
Reliable	3
We have one!	3
Drivers remind you of when they'll return for pick-up.	2
Makes transportation available to those with limitations (i.e. ongoing conditions), advancing age etc..	1
A gift and life support system that needs more positive recognition	1
Always on time, always courteous and smiles on faces	1
Beach/Park	1

Responses

Comfortable Ride	1
Convenience	1
Cost	1
Discount Card	1
Don't have to bother family	1
Drivers are patient and will wait	1
Drivers are trained to deal with injury/mobility-concerns	1
Drivers will help you on and off bus	1
Easier living	1
Easy to Board Bus	1
Economical	1
Gives me independence and self sufficiency	1
Good wheelchair service	1
Great Buses	1
Having help when you need it	1
Helping on/off bus	1
Helps people who can't walk to bus stops	1
I don't have to worry about parking in M.B.	1
I know I'll be greeted cheerfully	1
Less worrying	1
More parking available in the City	1
Most drivers are great	1
My main transportation and I can depend on it	1
Nice looking buses (although awfully large)	1
Nice People	1
Not able to function without Dial A Ride	1
Not being any worse	1
One of the better services that M.B. offers	1
Prompt, courteous and helpful demeanor eases stress	1
Take multiple passengers	1
Valuable program for seniors	1
Way to get around; essential for our city	1
Will take to Green Line Station	1

13.) What improvements or changes can we make to the City of Manhattan Beach Dial-A-Ride service? (open-ended question)

	# Responses
No Answer	90
None	12
Longer operating hours, including weekends	9
Requires less advance notice	8
Would like to buy cab tickets	7
Difficult to call ahead/more same day rides	5
Have later medical pick-ups	5
Stagger Lunch Breaks	4
Better service/more availability for medical rides	3
Same day rides hard to schedule	3
Taxi Options	3
Always see only 2 people on bus	2
Buses provide "rough ride."	2
Don't close for lunch	2
Extend destinations a little further	2
Longer hours like Hermosa Wave	2
More rides available during the day	2
More trips to Bay Cities	2
Driver should always make sure rider is in the right place before leaving	1
More trips to other attractions i.e. museums, other Beach	1
Cities points of interest	1
Entire program needs to be studied for efficient utilization of time, efficiency, very expensive	1
Ability to pick up more than one person at a time	1
Airport rides available	1
Better seat belts on bus	1
Bus needs bigger clocks	1

Responses

Buses are too big, replace with SUVs	1
Buses to promote Farmer's Market	1
Daily "Route Schedule" that 1 bus is dedicated to 3 times/day	1
Destinations in Redondo/Torrance on weekends	1
Drivers should always check maps	1
Early morning rides for dr. appt.	1
Evening hours	1
Female drivers don't help riders off/on bus as much	1
Having designated pick-ups with signs	1
I don't think you need so many big buses	1
Less confusion with schedule/date/time/rides	1
Less use of civilian sedans (hard to transfer in/out)	1
Less wait time for return Dr.s Appt.	1
More discounts at local restaurants	1
More publicity and positive public relations needed	1
Need 1 or 2 Cars	1
Not using bus when it's a one or two person ride	1
Okay as is	1
Organizations get preferential treatment over individuals	1
Pick-ups available at 8 AM, Lunch Hour, and after 4 PM	1
Printed Schedules	1
Providing rides to Palos Verdes Urgent Care (PM)	1
Scheduling rides further in advance	1
Stop lying by saying "bus is full" when it's empty	1
This program is too expensive to run	1

14.)

The following questions are not specifically about the City of Manhattan Beach Dial-A-Ride program, but rather about transportation services in general. Please read each question carefully:

#1 If you are unable to drive, please rank your preference for transportation by marking the following list with 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5:

Ranking:	1	2	3	4	5
City of Manhattan Beach Dial-A-Ride service	70	22	15		4
Cab service	25	27	18	6	10
Fixed-route bus transportation (Beach Cities Transit, MTA...)	4	16	20	8	10
ACCESS Paratransit Service	4	8	4	12	6
Volunteer Driver	19	10	16	17	11
Other. Please describe	11	6	1		3

Number who did not answer: 57

Other:	# Responses
Friends/Family	8
Caretaker	2
Helpful neighbors	2
Scan Health Insurance (pays for 12 trips a year)	2
Van service to LAX	2
Walking	2
Dedicated bike pathways	1
Green Line	1
Self (I still drive)	1

#2 Question #2 (a-d) is asking about taxi cab service:

a) How many times have you used a taxi cab in the past year?

	# Responses
No answer	52
Zero	49
1	22
2	14
3	16

	# Responses
4	9
5	6
6	2
7	2
8	1
9	0
10	4
more than 10	7
more than 20	1
more than 30	0
more than 40	1
more than 50	2
doesn't know	1
<i>total</i>	189

b) When using a taxi cab this year, what were your destinations? (open-ended question)

	# Responses
LAX	82
No answer	74
Dr. Appointments	31
Home	5
The Valley	3
Car Dealer	2
Local destinations	2
Redondo beach shopping	2
Shopping	2
Amtrak	1
Anderson Park (Redondo)	1
Carson Comm. Ctr.	1
Children's Hospital	1
Church	1
El Segundo	1
Hermosa Beach	1
Hotels	1

	# Responses
Inglewood (hospital)	1
Long Beach Airport	1
Marina del Rey (hospital)	1
n/a	1
Private Residence	1
Restaurants	1
San Pedro to go on Cruise	1
Santa Monica	1
South Bay Area	1
Theater	1
Vets	1

c) Were you satisfied with the taxi cab service?

	# Responses
Yes	69
No	30
No Answer	74

d) Please explain what you liked or did not like about using a taxi cab. (open-ended question)

	# Responses
No Answer	80
Dirty Cabs	40
Expensive	39
Mean drivers/not courteous	17
Cab was very late	9
Prompt	6
Same day rides available	6
Unsafe drivers (speeding, talking on phone)	5
Usually speak/understand limited English	5
Cab drivers don't know the area	4
Cabs are quick and timely	4
Have not used Dial-A-Ride but prefer taxis	3
Uncomfortable	3

Responses

Drivers very rude if for short distance trips	2
Easier than driving	2
No excessive waits with cabs	2
No help into the cab	2
Not there at appointed time	2
Taxis are curb to curb and handles luggage	2
Cabs raised fare because he had to	1
"cross Rosecrans"(Beverly Hills Cab Co.)	1
Prefer taxis for medical so wait times aren't too long, especially when you're feeling ill	1
Cab drivers aren't trained to deal with those who have mobility/injury concerns	1
Available as back up	1
Cab driver didn't help with my bags/luggage	1
Cab drivers get mad if you don't tip or don't tip enough	1
Can be used in the evening	1
Can go to airport	1
Did not like unfamiliar person	1
Driver goes the longest possible way	1
Driver listens	1
Drivers don't seem happy when you say MB (from LAX)	1
Drivers don't always know locations	1
Drivers not helpful	1
Easy to make arrangements 24/7 (convenient)	1
Have not used a cab in over a year but prefers taxi	1
Have to tell driver how to get to destination	1
Like leaving my car in my garage	1
No problem	1
Only option for 6 AM surgery	1
Only passenger/don't have to share ride	1
Save time compared to Super Shuttle	1
Seating is too limited	1
Stole money	1
Taxi never showed up	1

# Responses	
Time consuming	1
Trying to get the same driver	1
We like cabs when dial-ride cannot wait for us	1
Worried they won't show up on time	1